



Disease Detective....Claims, Evidence, Reasoning, Solution, Rebuttal

CLAIM

It all points towards the Broad Street pump being a hot spot in the city, and it would make total sense if it was the thing that spread Cholera, as it is used so much. All these people that got Cholera had a connection to the pump.

Cholera is caused when the feces of a person with cholera gets into a water system or food. The outhouses in the poor part of town have little to no sanitation and since there is no filtration for the water, cholera could have easily gotten into the water and contaminated it.

Thomas Sutterfield

Evidence: Fell ill two hours after stopping off to visit his Aunt “Tilda”. He had tea, biscuits and sausages with his great aunt. It was a hot day and he took a drink of cool water before leaving.

Reasoning: When Thomas Sutterfield was visiting his great aunt Tilda, Tilda only likes the water from the Broad Street Pump so as Thomas was leaving her house he said he got a drink of water, he had to of drank the water from Tilda’s that she got from the Broad Street Pump. Also, Thomas was the only one in his family to contract Cholera and go to Tildas house where she had Cholera from the water. This supports my claim because all of Tildas water was hauled from the Broad Street Pump.

Matilda Wright

Evidence: Matilda Wright refused to drink water from the faucets in her home. She would only drink the sweet tasting water that her gardener hauled to her home from the Broad Street pump.

Reasoning: Since Matilda Wright was living in her mansion in Marston Court and she would only drink the water from the Broad Street Pump. She lived with her three servants, her servants would work and live at Matilda's home and use Matilda's indoor plumbing. Matilda would use the water from Broad Street Pump that is where she has to be getting Cholera from. To show the separation in different water the servants did not contract Cholera because they used the water at Matilda's indoor plumbing.

Matilda Wright...additional reasoning

“Matilda also mentions the water tastes sweet, that is why she has her gardener go every day to get water from the Broad Street pump.”

“Matilda Wright (Thomas Sutterfields great aunt) refuses to drink the water from her faucet so she insists that she gets water from the broad street water pump. She is so wealthy that she can afford indoor plumbing but she only will drink water from the broad street pump, this supports the claim because she was the only one in that household that drinks that water and she was the only one who had died.”

Tolly Martin

Evidence: Following his fight with another boy, Tolly Martin washed the blood off his mouth at the Broad Street pump and ran off with a sausage stolen from the butcher shop. Died of cholera two days after a fist fight in Broad Street Square. Tolly Martin died of cholera two days after a fist fight in Broad Street Square.

Reasoning: This supports my claim because it shows that Tolly Martin cleaning himself off with the contaminated water, but Tolly also stole a sausage so it could be one of those two things that he died from but its most likely to get if form the water because the butcher store isn't getting a lot of people sick it was only accused of selling spoiled meat. So when Tolly was washing off with water that's when he caught Cholera.

Tolly Martin...additional reasoning

“When Tolly Martin washed off blood that he got on his face from a fight at the broad street water pump, he could have consumed some of that water and that is what had gotten him sick.”

“Later he died from cholera just after using the Broad Street pump which means that the broad street pump is what had gotten him sick.”

Mucky Johnson

Evidence: Mucky Johnson often went to talk and eat at the Broad Street Square, he said that the water there was the best in the city.

Reasoning: Mucky Johnson's only encounter with people was through his delivering food for the Coventry Market, but Mucky would stop by at Broad Street Square for lunch and to talk to people. There is no one on Muckys delivering run that had cholera so he had to have gotten it at the Broad Street Square. Also Mucky claims that the water there is the best in the city. This supports my claim because Broad Street Square is where people have been getting sick.

Mucky Johnson...additional reasoning

“One piece of evidence could be Mucky Johnson’s death. Mucky’s death is important my claim because he loved drinking water from the Broad Street pump, saying it was the best in the town. This backs up my claim because after drinking from the Broad street pump he died just like many other people.”

“Mucky Johnson is a delivery boy who lives in Coventry circle. He usually stops at broad street to eat and to talk to people, he claims that the broad street water pump is the best in the city. This supports my claim because the broad street water pump is very close to the outdoor bathrooms which means there is a possibility that the waste from the bathrooms got underground and contaminated the water. If people continue to drink that water they will only get sick and potentially die. Mucky did get sick and died.”

Slye Family

Evidence: When the three Slye children were not in school they, often accompanied their father to work and played in Broad Street Square the children were the only family members who contracted cholera.

Reasoning: This supports my claim because if the three Slye children were the only ones to go to Broad Street Square that has to be where they got it from. Also the Slye family recently moved to Kings Street with indoor plumbing so if the children were in contact with the Broad Street Pump and the rest of the family used the indoor plumbing that shows the separation of different water, the three children got Cholera from the Broad Street Pump.

Slye Family...additional reasoning

“Three of the eight Slye children went to work with their father and played in Broad Street Square. Those three children were the only family members who contacted cholera. This evidence backs up my claim because the only people in the family who spent much time in Broad Street Square got cholera meaning they may have drank some water from the pump while playing.”

Butcher Lane, Ely Street, Queen's Row, Paddy Lane

EVIDENCE

Poor area with outdoor toilets

No indoor plumbing

Many cholera cases

Got water from public pump

Broad Street pump was closest

Butcher Lane, Ely Street, Queen's Row, Paddy Lane

REASONING

“My final piece of evidence is that people living around Broad Street are poor. Large families are crowded in one and two room apartments. None of the apartments have indoor plumbing so they use outdoor toilets and haul their water from the nearest public pump. This backs up my claim because we know that cholera spreads to people from infected food and drinks and when someone uses outdoor toilets, there is a chance that the water pump nearest to the toilet may get contaminated.”

“Some waste from the outdoor toilets leaks out and it goes into the water system and contaminates the water. This evidence supports my claim because the waste could contaminate the water and make all the people that drink it get sick.”

Butcher Lane, Ely Street, Queen's Row, Paddy Lane

MORE REASONING

“My first piece of evidence is that the people that live on broad street are poorer so they are trying to get the water that is closest to them which is the broad street water pump. If the water is infected with cholera like we think then all of the people who live on broad street and get their water from that pump will almost certainly get cholera. This supports my claim because if the people get their water from the broad street water pump and then they get cholera this means that the broad street water pump could be infected.”

“The residents of the apartments had no running water so they had to haul the water from the nearest pump which was the Broad Street pump.”

Ausley and Marthy Brown

EVIDENCE

Only people on Ely Street who did not get cholera

Visited relatives in Soho, hauled their water from Soho pump

Ausley and Marthy Brown

REASONING

“My second piece of evidence is that anyone who didn’t get their water from the Broad Street pump seemed to remain healthy. My reasoning for this evidence is that Ausley and Marthy Brown and their two children who lived on Ely Street visited Marthy’s family in Soho. They also often pumped water from the Soho pump instead of the Broad Street pump. Their family was the only family on Ely Street to not get infected with cholera and to not get their water from the Broad Street pump.”

“They only use the soho water pump and they don’t get disease and all the other people use the water pump on broad street and get the disease.”

Ausley and Marthy Brown

MORE REASONING

“Another piece of evidence could be the fact that the Brown family was the only one living on Ely street to NOT catch cholera. The fact that the Brown family did not get infected with cholera backs up my claim because the Brown family gathered their water from the Soho pump rather than the improperly taken care of pump in Broad Street.”

“The Brown family go and visit their family in the soho area often, they usually just haul their water from the soho water pump. They were the only ones on their street that did not get cholera. This supports that the broad street water pump is the thing getting everyone so sick because they did not drink from the water pump and they were the only ones who did not get sick.”

Turner Family

Owen and Obedience Turner and their three children lived on Paddy Lane behind the butcher shop. This means that they would have gotten their water from the pump on Broad Street. They all came down with cholera and died from it.

John and Mary Canty

Evidence

Died of cholera

Often visited John's ailing mother on Butcher Lane

Reasoning

Since they visited John's mother they probably were drinking water from the Broad Street pump when they were there.

ADDITIONAL EVIDENCE

“One final piece of evidence that backs up my claim is that nobody on Langston Street was reported dead from cholera, this very strongly supports my claim because the residential areas in the east side of langston street are closer to the Soho pump, this suggests that the majority of people living there get their water from the Soho pump and not the Broad Street pump.”

SOLUTION

“One way that the Cholera outbreak can be prevented is by closing the broad street pump to get the disease out the water system at the Broad Street Pump. But then you would have to think where would all of the people go that live around there and use that water. The people would have to go and live by the Soho Pump, pump by Coventry market or if one of the wealthier people like Matilda Wright would let them live in her mansion for indoor plumbing that would work too. Another way that you could stop the Cholera outbreak would be by getting a water filter and attaching it to the water pumps so you can get some clean water. To sum it up the Cholera outbreak started from the good tasting water at the Broad Street Pump and it will end there too.”

SOLUTION

“A way to stop the spread of cholera would be to stop using the broad street water pump, and to move the outdoor bathrooms to a location farther away from any of the pumps. By stopping the use of the broad street water pump people wouldn’t get sick as easy. By moving the bathrooms farther away from the pump would help to decontaminate the water.”

REBUTTAL

Why the Butcher Shop is not the source of the cholera outbreak.

My fifth piece of evidence is that no other place in town seems to be the cause of the outbreak. Take the butcher shop as an example. Tolly martin ran off with a sausage from the butcher after washing his cuts of in the Broad Street pump. So even though Tolly had a sausage he still had some link to the Broad Street pump before getting sick. But that is only one person. There are too many occurrences where people have gotten sick but have had nothing to do with the meat from the butcher shop. The butcher himself did not get sick even though he worked with the meat. He would have brought meat home for his family, but only the three children who played near the Broad Street pump got sick. Poor people probably did not have the money to buy meat. People who lived in more wealthy areas were more likely to buy meat. The courts found the butcher innocent of selling spoiled meat